

East and West
The Medieval Church
Donald E. Knebel
May 20, 2018

Slide 1

1. Last week, we saw how councils held under the authority of the Roman emperors established orthodox beliefs for Christians living in the empire.
2. These ecumenical councils that established orthodoxy for what was then known as the “universal” or “catholic” church all took place in what is now Turkey, far to the east of Rome, which people in the west often consider the center of the early church.
3. Today, we will look more closely at the church in the west, with allegiances to the Bishop of Rome, as it essentially became the state in the wake of the fall of the Western Roman Empire.
4. We will also look at the different beliefs and practices that eventually led to the permanent separation of the church in the west from that in the east.
5. We will end this series by examining why the church in the east and the church in the west had such different responses to claimed heresies and what we might learn from those different responses.

Slide 2

1. As we discussed last week, in 325 A.D., the Council of Nicaea called by Roman Emperor Constantine labeled as heresy the views of the so-called “Arians,” who believed that Jesus had been created by God and therefore was not equal to God.
2. However, the Arian view persisted and a committed Arian, Eusebius of Nicomedia, became the bishop or patriarch of Constantinople and baptized Constantine on his death bed.
3. In 381, Emperor Theodosius the Great summoned the bishops to a Council in Constantinople, which adopted the views of the Cappadocian Fathers that God, Jesus and the Holy Spirit were of the same substance but had different expressions (*hypostases*) and reaffirmed the rejection of Arianism.
4. After Theodosius, the empire was again divided between east and west, as it had been before Constantine, and a part was given to each of his two sons.
5. Various Germanic-speaking tribes, including the Goths, continued pushing their way into the western regions of the empire to escape the Huns who were attacking them.

Slide 3

1. We tend to think of these so-called “barbarians,” which simply means non-Greeks or outsiders, as pagans.
2. However, they had become acquainted with Christianity from prisoners of war from Cappadocia, a Christian area since the days of Paul.
3. In 341 A.D., Eusebius of Nicomedia, the same Arian Bishop of Constantinople who had baptized Constantine, appointed a bishop to the Goths.
4. In 376 A.D., the king of the Goths accepted Arian Christianity as the official religion for all his people.
5. Other Germanic tribes also adopted Arian Christianity.
6. As one author states: **“It was not just the Visigoths, however, but their neighbors as well – the Ostrogoths, the Vandals in part, and the Burgundians – who had embraced Christianity in its Arian form before invading the empire.”** Walker, *A History of Christianity* at 148.
7. So, at the same time that the Council in Constantinople in 381 was adopting the Trinity based on the views of the Cappadocian Fathers, Germanic tribes that traced their religion to other Cappadocians were coming into the empire in the west and espousing a view of Jesus that the empire officially considered heresy.
8. In fact, one author suggests that Theodosius promoted the non-Arian view of Jesus to **“define a fault line along which he could rally his own troops against ‘the barbarians.’”** Freeman, *A.D. 381* at 103.

Slide 4

1. But the Western Roman Empire proved powerless to stop the advances of the Arian tribes.
2. In 410, the Visigoths sacked Rome.
3. They persecuted the non-Arian Catholics, Christians who accepted the orthodox views of the ecumenical councils.
4. Refugees from Rome escaped across the Mediterranean to the Catholic Christian communities in North Africa.

Slide 5

1. The most important bishop in North Africa was Augustine, the Bishop of Hippo.

2. In his younger days, Augustine had followed a Persian version of Christianity called Manichaeism, which taught that Jesus was a savior but that there were two gods, one who had created the evil material world and one which had created the spirits.
3. Augustine had a mistress, with whom he had a son, and lived a life that he later considered sinful.
4. During a visit to Ambrose, the Bishop of Milan, Augustine converted to orthodox Christianity and returned to North Africa.
5. Augustine wrote his famous “City of God” in response to the claims of the refugees that they should have stayed with their old Roman gods since the God of the Christians had not saved Rome from destruction.
6. Augustine argued that secular governments could never be counted on and the only security came from God, so the church should be seen as a substitute for the state.
7. This idea became an important tenet of the western church.

Slide 6

1. Augustine articulated other beliefs that became important to the western church.
2. He formalized the doctrine of original sin, in which **“Adam’s guilt was passed on like some inherited moral disease to his descendants through sexual appetite.”** Moynahan, *The Faith* at 149.
3. Perhaps drawing on his own experience, Augustine taught that it impossible for people to live a life free of sin unless they have received the grace of God.
4. **“Since sin was present from birth, Augustine held that even infants who died unbaptized were damned.”** *Id.*

Slide 7

1. Most important to later conflicts between the east and west, Augustine taught that the Holy Spirit was the unifying force in the Trinity.
2. As one author states: **“To Augustine, the Spirit represented love, and just as love binds the church together on earth, so the Spirit is the love which binds together Father and Son.”** Placher, *A History of Christian Theology* at 101.

Slide 8

1. As we discussed last week, Leo I, the Bishop of Rome we now call the pope, did not believe that ecumenical councils called by the emperor in the east were needed to determine what beliefs should be considered heretical.
2. He claimed the ability to make that judgment himself as the successor to Peter, who he believed was the greatest of the disciples.
3. The emperor in Constantinople rejected this position and the Council of Chalcedon in 451 recognized the Bishop of Constantinople, usually called the “Patriarch,” as the equal of the Bishop of Rome, now called the pope.
4. Pope Gelasius I, who followed Leo, taught that the pope was the supreme authority in protecting people’s souls and that the emperor’s job was limited to using his power to protect them from physical harm.
5. That view was exactly the opposite of eastern emperors who, since Constantine, had assumed the authority to become involved in matters of faith.
6. The stage was being set for division between east and west.

Slide 9

1. **“The political unity of the Greek east and the Latin west was destroyed by the barbarian invasions and never permanently restored.”** Ware, *The Orthodox Church* at 43.
2. The last Roman emperor in the west gave up his throne in 476 A.D.
3. That event dramatically increased the claimed authority of the Bishop of Rome.
4. The conquering Arians did not bring with them governmental institutions.
5. As one Roman Catholic author states: **“[Pope Leo] left behind a papacy that was now fully conscious of its prerogatives and equipped with the prestige to carry them out; a papacy that was ready, when the empire totally collapsed, to embark on one of its great historic missions: taming the barbarians and salvaging for humanity the elements of the ancient civilization.”** Bokenkotter, *A Concise History of the Catholic Church* at 93.
6. Another author says that **“when the Latin-speaking Roman Empire collapsed in the West in the fifth century, its civil servants promptly transferred to the payroll of the Western Church.”** MacCulloch, *The Reformation* at 12.

7. The church was able to accomplish these tasks because of its hierarchical structure, emulating the former structure of the Western Roman Empire, even using the same terminology – a “diocese” was an organizational unit of the Roman Empire.

Slide 10

1. In 486, Clovis, the leader of the Franks, another German tribe, established himself as the ruler of a large territory in what is now France.
2. He married a princess who had accepted orthodox Christianity and in 496 A.D., Clovis and 3000 of his men were baptized, establishing a beachhead for orthodox Christianity among the Arian tribes of Western Europe.
3. Clovis later conquered many of the Arian kingdoms that surrounded him, converting them to orthodox Christianity in the process.
4. In doing this, he was aided by the Catholic bishops in these areas, **“since he was preferable to their Arian rulers.”** Bokenkotter, *A Concise History of the Catholic Church* at 99.
5. The conversion of Clovis is one of the turning points in western history.
6. Had Clovis not defeated the Arians, it is likely that the Arians would have controlled all of Western Europe and we might all believe that Jesus is inferior to God.

Slide 11

1. In 568, another Germanic tribe called the Lombards, many of whom were Arian Christians, came into Italy.
2. The empire was unable to stop its advances.
3. For the Italians, there was no longer any effective civil government.
4. **In view of the inability of the Eastern Roman Empire to stop the pillaging Lombards in the West, Gregory assumed the responsibility of feeding the Roman populace, of repairing the walls, and of mustering the troops.”** Bokenkotter, *A Concise History of the Catholic Church* at 101.
5. Under Pope Gregory the Great, the church in the west was becoming the state.

Slide 12

1. Pepin the Short became King of the Franks in 751.
2. At this time, a document called the “Donation of Constantine” first appeared.

3. The document purported to be a fourth century decree by Emperor Constantine transferring authority over lands in Western Europe to the pope, the Bishop of Rome, as successor to Peter and spiritual leader of the entire Christian church.
4. Although much later determined to be a forgery, Pope Stephen II used the Donation of Constantine to convince Pepin to give him lands in Italy captured from the Lombards.
5. Those lands became the Papal States, giving the pope additional temporal authority.

Slide 13

1. In 771, Charles the Great (Charlemagne), the son of Pepin, became the leader of the Franks.
2. Through a series of successful military campaigns, he extended his rule throughout much of Western Europe.
3. You can see the territory controlled by Charlemagne on this map.
4. Because Charlemagne, like Clovis, believed that Jesus and God were equal, most of the people in these areas were now aligned with the pope, the Bishop of Rome.
5. Because the Muslims had conquered Alexandria and Antioch, the only other bishop with importance comparable to the Bishop of Rome was the Patriarch of Constantinople – the Church now had only two power centers.
6. But there was an important difference -- Constantinople was the capital of a functioning empire and Rome was not.

Slide 14

1. In 800 A.D., Charlemagne went to Rome to investigate a charge that Pope Leo III was guilty of adultery.
2. Charlemagne accepted Pope Leo's solemn oath that he was not guilty and exiled those who had brought the charges.
3. Two days later, on Christmas Day 800 A.D., a thankful and relieved Pope Leo crowned Charlemagne the Holy Roman Emperor, a brand new title.
4. The people in the east **“considered the formation of [Charlemagne’s] Holy Roman Empire an act of political sabotage and Leo’s complicity in the coronation an act of schism.”** Clendenin, *Eastern Orthodox Christianity* at 41.

5. But the eastern emperor was powerless to do anything about this affront.
6. Although the Franks controlled the territory that is now Western Europe and their leaders beginning with Charlemagne were called “emperors,” they did not have the organizational capacity to govern the territory.
7. So the civil government of much of Western Europe was effectively in the hands of the pope and the western church.
8. As one author states: “[T]he state was no longer regarded as something distinct but was seen rather as an aspect of the Church.” *Id.*
9. The western church levied taxes and decided who would be the Holy Roman Emperor.
10. Charlemagne’s son was crowned emperor by the pope, “**who made it clear that the crown itself derived from the successor of Peter.**” Bokenkotter, *A Concise History of the Catholic Church* at 111.
11. On the other hand, in the Eastern Empire, the emperor chose the Patriarch of Constantinople.

Slide 15

1. Christians in the Greek-speaking Eastern Empire, usually called the “Byzantine Empire” after the fall of Rome, rejected the claims of the popes in Rome to speak for all Christians.
2. As one author states: “**The Greeks assigned to the Pope a primacy of honour, but not the universal supremacy which he regarded as his due.**” Ware, *The Orthodox Church* at 47.
3. The eastern church, within a still-functioning empire, believed that decisions on spiritual matters must be made by a council of bishops as decisions had been made beginning with the Council of Nicaea called by Emperor Constantine.
4. Because of their different histories, the eastern and western churches had developed “**two different conceptions of the visible organization of the Church.**” *Id.*

Slide 16

1. The different conception of church organization was one of many differences that had developed between the western church, with its head in Rome, and eastern church, with its head in Constantinople.
2. The church in the east spoke Greek and the church in the west spoke Latin.

3. In the west, priests were required to remain celibate, but in the east priests could marry and only bishops had to be celibate.
4. The west used unleavened bread for Communion, but the east used leavened bread.
5. The western churches baptized by sprinkling, while the eastern churches baptized by triple immersion.
6. The west made the sign of the cross by touching the left shoulder first, while the east touched the right shoulder first.
7. The eastern church rejected the idea of original sin that had been taught in the west by Augustine.
8. But none of those differences was nearly as important as what became known as the "*filioque* controversy," a dispute over a single word.

Slide 17

1. As we saw last week, the Second Ecumenical Council, attended only by bishops from the Eastern Roman Empire, modified what became known as the "Nicene Creed" by adding a provision saying that the Holy Spirit "**proceeds from the Father.**"
2. The conclusion that the Holy Spirit had come from the Father was based on *John* 15:26, in which Jesus promised "**the spirit of truth who goes out from the father.**"
3. In the sixth century, Christians in Spain began adding the word "*filioque*," meaning "and the son," to the Latin version of the Nicene Creed to assert that the Holy Spirit "**proceeds from the Father and the Son.**"
4. This decision drew on the teachings of Augustine, who considered the Holy Spirit to bind Jesus and the Father together.
5. In 796, a council of western bishops meeting in France approved adding the *filioque* to the Nicene Creed, the Holy Spirit proceeding from the Father and the Son.

Slide 18

1. "**When the Greek Church heard of this formulation, they were outraged.**" Freeman, *A.D.* 381 at 167.
2. First, the eastern church objected to any change in a creed that had not been adopted by an ecumenical council called by the emperor and considered the change "**a sin against the unity of the Church.**" Ware, *The Orthodox Church* at 49.

3. Second, the eastern church thought that the idea that the Holy Spirit could proceed from Jesus was **“theologically untrue and a threat to the doctrine of the Trinity.”** Clendenin, *Eastern Orthodox Christianity* at 42.
4. In fact, the eastern church thought that the idea that the Holy Spirit could proceed from Jesus, who was the only begotten Son of the Father, was theological nonsense.
5. Some ridiculed the *filioque* as making the Holy Spirit the Grandson of God.
6. On the other hand, Charlemagne **“reproached [eastern] Christians for failing to adopt the version of the Nicene Creed that contained the term *filioque*.”** *Id.* at 41.

Slide 19

1. Disagreements over the *filioque* figured in a dramatic confrontation concerning Photius, appointed Patriarch of Constantinople by the Byzantine emperor in 858.
2. Photius has been called **“the most distinguished thinker, the most outstanding politician, and the most skillful diplomat ever to hold the office of Patriarch of Constantinople.”** Ware, *The Orthodox Church* at 50.
3. Photius publicly rejected the west’s addition of the *filioque* to the Nicene Creed.
4. Pope Nicholas I, considering himself the sole authority on spiritual matters for all Christians, objected to the appointment of Photius and sought to have him removed.
5. Two separate councils were held to try to resolve this dispute, the second rejecting the action of the first.
6. The pope accepted only results of the first council, while the eastern emperor rejected the results of the first council and accepted only the action of the second.
7. This was the first time that the western church had not accepted the decision of an ecumenical council called by the eastern emperor.
8. In about 865, Photius **“branded the entire Latin church as heretical for inserting the term *filioque* into the Nicene Creed.”** Clendenin, *Eastern Orthodox Christianity* at 42.

Slide 20

1. The controversy over the *filioque* continued, with the western church insisting that it belonged in the Creed and the eastern church rejecting the addition.
2. In 1014, Pope Benedict VII added the *filioque* to the Mass for the first time, effectively calling on all western churches to do the same.

3. The pope had thrown down the gauntlet at the feet of the leaders in the east.

Slide 21

1. In 1054, Pope Leo IX directed a letter to the Patriarch of Constantinople, citing the forged Donation of Constantine for the proposition that the eastern church had to recognize the pope's unquestionable authority over matters of faith and accept the *filioque* as part of the Nicene Creed.
2. Pope Leo sent a delegation to Constantinople with the letter, charging the eastern church with heresy for omitting the *filioque*.
3. This charge obviously ignored the fact that it was the western church that had added the *filioque* to the Nicene Creed in the first place.
4. The Patriarch of Constantinople had no interest in hearing the views of the pope on matters of faith and refused to see the pope's delegates.
5. The pope's delegates then went to the *Hagia Sophia*, the most important church in the east, and laid a papal bull on the altar, excommunicating the patriarch.
6. The patriarch responded by excommunicating the pope's delegates.

Slide 22

1. The ultimate result of these actions was the "Great Schism," separating the Church now known as the Roman Catholic Church, centered in Rome, from the Eastern Orthodox Church, centered in Constantinople.
2. **"To the East it was the Western Christians who left, because they abandoned the ancient faith, embracing new ideas like the *filioque* and increased papal authority."** Mathewes-Green, *Welcome to the Orthodox Church* at 46.
3. As a result, the Eastern Orthodox Church believes **"it alone has maintained an unbroken continuity with the apostolic faith of the New Testament."** Clendenin, *Eastern Orthodox Christianity* at 30.
4. Eastern Orthodoxy claims **"to be the one, holy, catholic, and apostolic Church, founded by Jesus Christ in the year of His death, A.D. 33."** Rosen, *Religions of America* at 112.
5. When Orthodox Christians recite the Nicene Creed, exactly as it was adopted in 381, they believe the **"one holy, catholic and apostolic Church"** refers to them.
6. The full name of the church is therefore "The Holy Orthodox Catholic Apostolic Eastern Church," which is usually shorted to "Eastern Orthodox" to avoid confusion with Roman Catholicism.

7. When Roman Catholics today recite the Nicene Creed, they continue to recite that the Holy Spirit proceeds from both the Father and the Son.

Slide 23

1. This map shows the division between the eastern and western churches.
2. The Russians, under Prince Vladimir, had adopted eastern Christianity in 988.
3. The areas east and south of the Mediterranean Sea, including all of what is now Israel, were controlled by the Muslims.

Slide 24

1. In 1076, Pope Gregory VII wrote to the Muslim leader of Algeria, acknowledging that **“we recognize and confess one sole God, although in different ways, and we praise and worship Him every day as creator and ruler of the world.”** Pagden, *Worlds at War: The 2500-Year Old Struggle Between East and West* at 211.
2. But Pope Gregory also thought that Jerusalem’s Church of the Holy Sepulcher should not be in the hands of the Muslims and began advocating efforts to take it back.
3. Pope Gregory is associated with a list of 27 statements of papal authority called the *Dictatus papae* issued in 1075.
4. One statement announced that the pope could be judged by no one.
5. Another announced **“[t]hat the Roman Church has never erred. Nor will it err, to all eternity.”**
6. Still another statement gave the pope the right to depose emperors.
7. No statement said the pope should be humble.

Slide 25

1. In 1095, Pope Urban II made a formal call for Roman Catholics to join in a war to evict the Muslims from the Holy Land.
2. Relying on the belief that his pronouncements were infallible, he promised the people that their sins would be forgiven if they joined this effort.

Slide 26

1. The response to the call of Pope Urban is now called the “first crusade.”
2. Urban’s apparent intent was to use the knights that had successfully beaten back the Vikings.

Slide 27

1. But the promise of having their sins forgiven and going directly to heaven was a powerful incentive for ordinary people to join the fight.
2. People with no military experience set out from Germany and France to attack the Muslims in the Holy Land – they were led by Peter the Hermit.
3. This became known as the “people’s crusade.”
4. Many of these people did not get very far because of lack of supplies and training.
5. They decided that it made no sense to try to get to Jerusalem to kill Muslims, whose beliefs they only vaguely understood.
6. Instead, they decided to kill the Jews that lived in their countries, who they believed were Christ killers.
7. Here is the report of an eyewitness: **“Look now, we are going to seek out our profanity and to take vengeance on the Ishmaelites for our Messiah, when here are the Jews who murdered and crucified him. Let us first avenge ourselves on them and exterminate them from among the nations so that the name of Israel will no longer be remembered or let them adopt our faith.”** Armstrong, *Holy War: The Crusades and their Impact on Today’s World* at 73.
8. The crusaders offered Jews the option of being baptized or being killed.
9. Thousands of Jews refused to reject their faith and were killed by the crusaders.

Slide 28

1. Better-trained crusaders eventually reached Jerusalem in 1099.
2. They laid siege to the city and finally broke through the city walls.
3. On their first day in the city, the crusaders killed all the Muslims they could find – if they found any Jews, they killed them as well.
4. At least 40,000 people were killed on the first day, including women and children.
5. This is the report of an eye witness: **“Wonderful sights were to be seen. Some of our men (and this was more merciful) cut off the heads of their enemies; others shot them with arrows, so they fell from towers; others tortured them longer by casting them into the flames. Piles of heads, hands and feet were to be seen in the streets of the city. . . . So let it suffice to say this much, at least, that in the Temple and porch of Solomon, men rode in blood up to their knees and bridle reins. Indeed it was a just and splendid judgement of God that this place should be filled with the**

blood of the unbelievers since it has suffered so long from their blasphemies.”
Armstrong, *Holy War: The Crusades and their Impact on Today's World* at 178 – 79.

Slide 29

1. The victorious crusaders set up the Christian Kingdom of Jerusalem.
2. This kingdom was ruled by Roman Catholics, who claimed superiority over local Eastern Orthodox Christians.

Slide 30

1. Saladin was a Muslim leader who led the effort to retake Jerusalem.
2. This is his tomb in Damascus.
3. In 1187, Saladin and his Muslim forces recaptured Jerusalem.
4. Several more crusades were launched to try to retake the city, but all failed.

Slide 31

1. In 1204, during the fourth crusade, Roman Catholic Christians from Europe captured Constantinople, the headquarters of the Eastern Orthodox Church.
2. Pope Innocent III, who had sent the crusaders, hoped to impose Roman Catholic beliefs on what remained of the Byzantine Empire.
3. The crusaders brought back to Europe relics from the churches in Constantinople, including two heads of John the Baptist.
4. Some people believe they also brought back to Europe what is now known as the “Shroud of Turin.”
5. For a while, Constantinople became a center of the Roman Catholic Church, but the people did not accept the teachings of Roman Catholicism and the city was recaptured by Byzantine forces in 1261.

Slide 32

1. With his success in capturing Constantinople, Pope Innocent III turned his attention to the Cathars, who practiced a form of Christianity that had become very popular in the south of France.
2. The Cathars believed, like the Gnostics and the Marcionites that we talked about in the third presentation, that the material world had been created by an evil God that was not the God of the New Testament.

3. The Cathars advocated celibacy and banned the eating of meat, milk and eggs, which they associated with the evils of reproduction.
4. **“They accepted Christ’s Sermon on the Mount as their ethic, and denounced war or any use of force, even against infidels.”** Durant, *Heroes of History* at 174.
5. They renounced the ownership of property and the swearing of oaths.
6. They rejected the concept of hell and thought that all men would be saved.
7. Because of what they thought was their own purity, Cathars claimed **“that they alone were the ‘true Christians’ leading an ‘apostolic life.’”** Walker, *A History of the Christian Church* at 304.
8. In 1209, Pope Innocent III declared that the Cathars were heretics and ordered a crusade against them, with the pope promising the crusaders that they would be relieved from the consequences of any past sins.
9. Knights attacked the Cathars and quickly **“slew 20,000 men, women, and children in indiscriminate massacre.”** Durant, *Heroes of History* at 176.
10. Because of the indiscriminate killings, many of those killed were Catholics.

Slide 33

1. In other cities, the Cathars were rounded up and expelled from the city naked, as shown in this picture.
2. This crusade, known as the Albigensian Crusade, finally ended in 1229, after it had killed between 100,000 and 200,000 people in the name of a loving God and a pope named Innocent because they dared to believe that killing people for their beliefs was against the teachings of Jesus.

Slide 34

1. With the Cathars eliminated, Pope Innocent III instituted a system of inquisitions, giving monks the assignment of identifying heretics and presenting them to secret church courts, in which the names of the accusers were not provided.
2. **“The definition of heresy was extended to include opposition to any papal pronouncement as well as to sacrilege, blasphemy, sorcery, sodomy, and the refusal to pay papal taxes; it was made ‘the duty of every Catholic to persecute heretics.’”** Moynahan, *The Faith* at 278.
3. Torture was officially sanctioned as a way of getting confessions.
4. **“As each bout of torture began, the inquisitor intoned: ‘Tell the truth, for the love of God.’”** *Id.* at 279.

5. In this print, you can see the monks preparing to take down a confession.
6. A finding of heresy could result in death, typically by being burned at the stake.
7. As one author states: **“The rationale for this cruel punishment was familiar and, on the whole, acceptable to medieval people: heresy, as treason against God, is far more heinous than treason against the king, itself punishable by death.”** Walker, *A History of the Christian Church* at 309.

Slide 35

1. At about the same time as the launching of the crusades and the inquisitions, educated people in Western Europe began studying the writings of Aristotle.
2. Aristotle had taught that the application of logic to what was learned by the senses could lead to undeniable truth.
3. Scholars in the west, called “scholastics,” tried to use the logic of Aristotle to prove that the teachings of the Roman Catholic Church were inherently correct.

Slide 36

1. Thomas Aquinas was the most famous of the scholastics, who attempted to use Aristotelian logic to prove the existence of God.
2. He also set out to prove the concept of purgatory that had been earlier considered by the western church.
3. He concluded that saints go directly to heaven on their death and unredeemed sinners go directly to hell.
4. Everyone else goes to an intermediate place, to work off their remaining sins before entering heaven. Placher, *A History of Christian Theology* at 183.

Slide 37

1. In 1302, Pope Boniface VIII issued the famous bull *Unam Sanctam*, claiming in no uncertain terms extraordinary secular powers for himself and his successors.
2. Citing the forged Donation of Constantine to support his claim to be entitled to absolute power as the successor of Peter, he claimed: **“I am Caesar; I am the emperor.”** Ehrman, *The Triumph of Christianity* at 284.
3. The bull announced that **“[t]he Pope can be judged by no man but by God alone; no earthly power can claim independence of the Pope, and insofar as any act has moral implications, it is subject to his judgment.”** Bokenkotter, *A Concise History of the Catholic Church* at 181.

4. He based this pronouncement on the teaching of Thomas Aquinas **“that it is altogether necessary to salvation for every human creature to be subject to the Roman pontiff.”** Walker, *A History of the Christian Church* at 371.

5. For Pope Boniface, **“the takeover of the empire was complete.”** Ehrman, *The Triumph of Christianity* at 284.

Slide 38

1. French King Philip rejected Boniface’s idea of absolute control and had the pope arrested just as he was about to excommunicate the king.

2. A subsequent French pope cancelled the excommunication of the king and moved the headquarters of the church from Rome to Avignon, on the Rhone River in what is now France.

3. Subsequent French popes built this magnificent palace for themselves in Avignon.

Slide 39

1. To explain how the popes could promise salvation to the crusaders, Thomas Aquinas taught that when Jesus and the saints died, they had a merit surplus, which they donated to the Catholic Church, creating a treasury of merits popes could dispense to forgive sins.

2. In 1343, Pope Clement VI announced from Avignon that the church could sell this treasury of merits to church members to guarantee their place in heaven, leading to the sale of indulgences.

3. Popes could spend the money from the sale of indulgences as they saw fit and much of the money went into paying the expenses of the papal palace in Avignon.

Slide 40

1. In 1378, the citizens of Rome rioted, demanding a Roman pope.

2. Under pressure, the cardinals chose a Roman pope, who sought to terminate French influence and returned the papacy to Rome.

3. Four months later, the same cardinals decided they had made a mistake and elected another pope, who returned to Avignon.

4. Both popes claimed authority and excommunicated each other, resulting in what is called the “Great Schism.”

5. Each pope claimed the loyalty of about half of Europe.

6. The Great Schism lasted until 1417, when the papacy was united in a new pope, located in Rome, as a result of the actions of the Council of Constance.

Slide 41

1. With the Roman Catholic Church once again united, its leaders were prepared to try to heal the divide with the Eastern Orthodox Church.
2. In 1438, representatives of the Eastern Orthodox Church and the Roman Catholic Church met in Florence to try to resolve their differences.
3. At the time, Constantinople was under siege from the Turks and the Eastern Church wanted help from the west to repel this threat.
4. The council got off on what might be called the “wrong foot” when the pope expected the patriarch of Constantinople to kiss his foot.
5. The patriarch’s response shows the differences between east and west at the time: **“From where does the Pope get this right? What council gave it to him? . . . If he is the successor to Peter, we are the successors of the other Apostles. Did they kiss the feet of Peter? . . . If the Pope wants a brotherly embrace, following the ancient custom of the church, I will embrace him. If he will not accept that, I will abandon everything and go home.”** Placher, *A History of Christian Theology* at 102.
6. The pope settled for a private embrace and the talk turned to trying to resolve the dispute over the *filioque*.
7. Eventually the eastern representatives agreed that the western church could continue with its version of the creed that included the *filioque* and a decree of union was signed.
8. However, when the eastern representatives got home they were denounced for having sold out to the enemy that had invaded Constantinople in 1204 and the decree was voided.

Slide 42

1. In 1453, Muslim forces captured Constantinople, ending the Byzantine Empire.
2. The Christians, although now required to pay special taxes, were relatively well treated by the Muslim rulers.
3. As one Orthodox author writes: **“The Muslims in the fifteenth century were far more tolerant toward Christianity than western *Christians* were towards one another during the Reformation and the seventeenth century.”** Ware, *The Orthodox Church* at 84-85.

Slide 43

1. The number of indulgences that the church could sell to forgive the sins of the living was limited by the number of living and the church needed additional funds.

2. In 1476, Pope Sixtus IV **“permitted the living to buy and apply indulgences to deceased loved ones assumed to be suffering in purgatory for unrepented sins.”** Ozment, *The Age of Reform: 1250-1550* at 217.
3. The church based the right to affect the souls of the dead on the teachings of Thomas Aquinas that the pope **“has direct jurisdiction over all souls, and can exercise his Episcopal rights in every territory.”** Walker, *A History of the Christian Church* at 348.
4. As one author states: **“Á door was thus opened to the unscrupulous to present an indulgence as a quasi-automatic and easy means of salvation.”** Bokenkotter, *A Concise History of the Catholic Church* at 214.

Slide 44

1. Until Sixtus IV, inquisitions had been under control of the pope.
2. On November 1, 1478, Sixtus IV yielded to pressure from King Ferdinand of Aragon, giving the king the ability to name his own inquisitors and carry out his own inquisitions.
3. The initial intent was to detect insincere conversions of Jews to Christianity to avoid persecution.
4. On March 31, 1492, after Ferdinand and Isabella had captured Granada from the Muslims, completing the reconquest of Spain, they issued the Alhambra Decree, ordering all Jews to leave Spain within four months unless they converted to Christianity.
5. By July 31, 1492, up to 800,000 Jewish residents had fled Spain to avoid execution without trial.
6. Many of those who fled settled in areas now controlled by Muslims, including what is now Israel.

Slide 45

1. The Spanish Inquisition represented a significant departure from previous practices – popes had found heresy only when baptized Christians had fallen away from Church orthodoxy.
2. Non-Christians were now to be killed unless they changed their beliefs or left the country.

Slide 46

1. As we come to the end of this series in about 1500 A.D., the Roman Catholic Church was selling indulgences to the unwary and executing those who had beliefs different from those in church leadership.
2. One author says: “[W]estern Christianity before 1500 must rank as one of the most intolerant religions in world history: its record in comparison with medieval Islamic history is embarrassingly poor.” MacCulloch, *The Reformation* at 676.
3. The reference to western Christianity is important in understanding this period.
4. After the Great Schism in 1054, the Eastern Orthodox Church did not engage in crusades or inquisitions – it did not burn people at the stake and its leaders did not send armies against those with different beliefs.
5. With a handful of exceptions at most, the response of the Eastern Orthodox Church to claimed heretics has been limited to excommunication.
6. What explains the much different experience of the eastern church with respect to people of other beliefs?

Slide 47

1. I will give you my opinion on that question.
2. Sam Harris, one of the New Atheists, writes: “**Certainty about the next life is simply incompatible with tolerance in this one.**” Harris, *The End of Faith* at 13
3. Unlike the church in the west, the Eastern Orthodox Church does not claim infallibility about matters of faith – its leaders have never claimed to be beyond human judgment and human limitations.
4. For Eastern Orthodox Christians, God is a perpetual mystery, to be experienced rather than understood, and “**true theology is wedded to actual experience and not relegated solely to the intellect.**” Clendenin, *Eastern Orthodox Christianity* at 55.
5. As a result, Eastern Orthodox Christians have long rejected efforts of western Christians such as Thomas Aquinas to “**enthron[e] reason and logic as the final arbiters of all matters of truth.**” *Id.* at 48.
6. One of the criticisms the east had to the addition of the *filioque* to the Nicene Creed was that it “**made the Trinity too rational**” “**instead of hinting at the essential incomprehensibility of God.**” Armstrong, *A History of God* at 200.

7. As one Eastern Orthodox author says: “[W]hat is important is not that we should argue about the deity, but that we should have a direct and living encounter with a concrete and personal God.” Ware, *The Orthodox Church* at 209.
8. Consequently, “Orthodoxy seeks to experience and express spiritual truth in the concrete, tangible forms of color and design and in music rather than in books or discourse.” Clendenin, *Eastern Orthodox Christianity* at 73.
9. When spiritual truth is expressed in colors and music, it is very hard to identify heretics and impossible to express certainty.
10. In my opinion, the world would be a better place if everyone had that view of religious truth.

References:

- Armstrong, *A History of God* (Ballantine Books 1993)
- Armstrong, Karen, *Holy War: The Crusades and their Impact on Today's World* (Anchor Books 2001)
- Bokenkotter, Thomas, *A Concise History of the Catholic Church* (Doubleday 2004)
- Clendenin, Daniel, *Eastern Orthodox Christianity* (Baker Academic 2003)
- Ehrman, Bart, *The Triumph of Christianity* (Simon & Schuster 2018)
- Freeman, Charles, *A.D. 381* (The Overlook Press 2009)
- Mathewes-Green, Frederica, *Welcome to the Orthodox Church* (Paraclete Press 2016)
- MacCulloch, Diarmaid, *The Reformation* (Penguin Books 2003)
- Moynahan, Brian, *The Faith: A History of Christianity* (Doubleday 2002)
- Ozment, Steven, *The Age of Reform: 1250-1550* (Yale University Press 1980)
- Pagden, Anthony, *Worlds at War: The 2500-Year Old Struggle Between East and West* (Random House 2008)
- Placher, William, *A History of Christian Theology* (Westminster Press 1983)
- Rosen, Leo, *Religions of America* (Simon & Schuster 1975)
- Walker, Williston, *A History of the Christian Church* (Scribner 1985)
- Ware, Timothy, *The Orthodox Church* (Penguin Books 2015) /